

**ANALYSIS OF THE MISSING LINKAGES OF GOVERNMENT  
POLICIES TO ADDRESS WOMEN'S UNPAID WORK IN PAKISTAN**

*Ghazala Umer Baghal  
Dr. Shuhabuddin Mughal  
Zareen Khan Rind*

**ABSTRACT**

*This research aims at analyzing the legal implication of policies to reduce the unpaid work and suggest policies measures for decision planners. This paper reviews some of the implemented policies in western and South Asian Countries and concluded that gender gap in terms of labour market which may affect women's socio-economic decision at household level. The state can play an important role in the implementing fair legislation policies to support a more equal distribution of responsibilities between men and women.*

---

**Keywords:** Unpaid and paid work, Gender Discrimination, Time Use Survey, Working Hours, Household Work

**INTRODUCTION**

Unpaid care work is contributing towards the well-being and quality of life to household and whole society, and that work still not counted and undervalued behind the economy. It is perceived that all the household and care work must have to do by female. She has to spend 8 to 10 hours on unpaid care work. In real sense unpaid care work has significant value because due to that work people of the society are able to work in labour market (Stiglitz *et.al.*, 2007).

According to Razavi (2007), in a day woman utilize time on preparing food, cleaning, washing dishes, laundry and look after children, ill and the elderly person along with perform additional task of agriculture and livestock activities. In spite of this contribution in terms of welfare, this contribution is commonly missing from policy program as a result negligence of unpaid care work leads to increase the gender inequality in terms of employment and other empowerment areas.

Naila (2003), reported that Women stereotypically spend large portion of the day to perform household work. Specially women in South Asian Countries, important part of the day she spends to fulfill

their responsibilities of domestic and reproductive roles. This is the main issue how decision makers and planners highlight issues concerning care work which may help to achieve gender equality. Gender discrimination in terms of division of work represents deprivation of women from basic rights (UN, 2013).

Different policy brief argues that gender discrimination in unpaid care work is the missing link that influences gender gaps in labour outcomes. The gender discrimination in unpaid care work has major negative impact on women's participation in the labour market and deprived from economic and employment opportunities. She has to divide limited time to perform work between productive and reproductive activities, paid and unpaid work.

The state can perform a significant role in the design and enforcement of fair legislation to support a more equal distribution of responsibilities between men and women. Alison Aggarwal shared that at the national-level, father-friendly leave policies in the UK and Nordic countries have strengthened opportunities and incentives for men to share domestic responsibilities.

Elson (2008), reported that the state can also have a significant impact on to reduce the work load of unpaid care work by providing infrastructure such as access to clean water and gas facility. Effective access of public services such as childcare facilities, universal social security or easy access to water facility at door step can help to reduce the unpaid care work from the individual to the state, which may increase opportunity of choices. In terms of public policies, another point of action identified is supportive taxation. For example, to allow tax for caretakers within the family to strengthen their capacity and for the financial empowerment of women who do not have another source of income?

**TABLE 1.1**  
**CALCULATION OF WOMEN'S WAGES (INDIA)**

Total Population	Female Population aged 15- 64	Value of unpaid work by women / month for 33 tasks (US Dollars)		Average Value	Total unpaid contribution of women/year
1.027 Billion	340 million	Rural Women	\$3*33 = \$ 99 Rs.4950	150*12= \$1,800 Rs.90,000	\$612,756,000,000 (\$612.8 billion) 29.5346797 trillion Indian Rupees
		Urban Women	\$6.1*33= \$ 201.3 Rs.10,065		

**Source:** Debra Efroymson (2010).

This table represents the total contribution of female in rural and urban areas of household economy. The value of all tasks can be estimated by multiplying average wages with the number of days which performed. Due to lower wage rate in rural areas as compared to urban areas, the total economic value is higher in urban areas as compared to rural areas. Assigning an economic value to those which work has no market the price of that household work is not fixed according to market mechanism that's why it's very difficult to assign value. The value of that work varies according to area to area. But there is wage discrimination between men and women in one region, these differences exist in every society.

It is not necessary any activity has required more time to complete and has a high monetary value, for food preparation, which requires 210 hours per month and assign low value (Another activity which consumes less time would be assigned higher value, such as nursing the sick and tutoring children). Women expand 60 hours per month for cleaning house, 20 hours per month for washing and ironing clothes, 30 hours per month required washing dishes, and 8 hours per month for sewing. By summing up all activities time it would be spending is 328 hours per month or almost 11 hours per day.

These figures show significant role played by women in daily life and economic value of that work is too much low. There are many different important activities performed by women fail to estimate, such as look after and instructing children, caring for the sick and the

elder person, maintaining a household. If a nurse or the person was employed to look after for disabled family members, 600-800 rupees would have to pay day for the employing labor; similarly, if we hired house made for other activities would have to pay a higher amount for each activity. It means when women performed all these activities she saved income of family member by reducing expenses.

#### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

According to Margarita (2009), defined that a work covered in the SNA (Systematic National Accounts) production boundary that is market oriented activities that work is counted in national statistics like sowing, weeding cotton picking, harvesting and another work is fall into general production boundary but outside the SNA boundary like household maintenance, management and shopping which are performed by female.

(Hirway 1998), concluded that the activities which were outside the SNA production boundary must be added in boundary called general production boundary because these activities provide services to their family member and must be considered.

The conceptual framework presented by Charmes, he further described that there are two main method used to assess and estimated unpaid work. One method is the System of National Accounts (SNA) reviewed in 1993. There is one drawback of this approach, production or services for own-consumption produce within the household were not included and may call it non-market work. A second approach which may clearly defined every activity in broader way that is called time use survey. This method attempts to capture how much time required performing every activity. Time use surveys are the effective tool for getting missing data

Furthermore, (Ilahi, 2000) has concluded from different literature of time use surveys suggests that there are significant differences between utilization of time between men and women in paid and unpaid work

In Japan the results of the valuation of unpaid work estimated by opportunity cost method and expressed that the opportunity cost method gives the overestimates, as compared to specialist wage approach and then the generalist wage approach. in 1996 these values were Y 117, 116 b., Y 98, 775 b, and T 75, 0 70 b. calculated by opportunity cost, the specialist wage method and the generalist wage

method respectively and these were 24.2%, 22.0% and 17.2% of the national production respectively.

The Japanese methods have systematic and provided required flexibility to the estimates (Webster, 1999).

#### **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This study is undertaken with development objective to suggest the policy measures undertaken by government and different organizations to integrate women's unpaid work. The Objective has achieved with reviewing past strategic plans, secondary review, implementation policies in different countries, this objective has achieved by review brief reports that highlight issues of gender equality and unpaid work in national development policies and strategies to review the policy brief that can be used to stimulate discussion at country level with a view towards developing locally adapted gender equality and unpaid work initiatives, and as an advocacy tool with a view towards increasing awareness of gender equality and unpaid work of the local to the international levels.

#### **IMPLEMENTED POLICIES FOR REDUCING UNPAID WORK AT THE NATIONAL POLICY LEVEL**

Deepta Chopra emphasized the importance of women's work and highlighted that advocacy with the state to ensure that unpaid care work becomes visible. In that regard, she shared information on a project by IDS in partnership with Action Aid country offices, through which policy makers realize the significance of unpaid care are explored. She also mentioned that unpaid care can be given more visibility on policy agendas in the context of issues different issue and challenges faced by women (Elson, Diane. 2008).

Unpaid care work as a target under goal of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is a welcome and unique step to recognize the value of unpaid care work. In addition, Deepta Chopra emphasized that the current target can be achieved to address the reduction of "Burden" of women successfully by providing infrastructure facilities.

Budlender, Debbie (2010), reported that in different countries many strategies, policies and measures have taken initiatives to reduce the burden of unpaid care work for women.

There was discussion between Australian Human Rights Commission, Institute of Development studies and United States Research for Social development in the post-2015 agenda “Addressing unpaid care” Participants highlighted the importance of changing attitudes and norms to highlight and reduce invisible work. Unpaid care work is rarely highlighted and integrated in policy development. Different policies in different sectors affect unpaid care work. For example, water management policies which may reduce women’s time spent in fetching water; provision of early childhood education may reduce burden of child care responsibilities and enable them to participate in economic activities; provision for care of disabled and person may reduce care responsibilities carried out by women of family members.

The report by the United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN-Women) entitled Progress of the World’s Women 2015-2016 comprehensively showed macroeconomic policy matters for gender equality and proper implementation of macroeconomic policy gender responsive for that purpose three key constraints that have been overlooked by the current macroeconomic paradigm must be addressed.

Member States have taken a different action to introduce gender-responsive macroeconomic frameworks through the integration of gender issues into strategies and programmes which has significant impact on macroeconomic performance, sectorial development, budgeting, tax policy and investment, and data collection to monitor and evaluate the impact of policy. For example, Senegal has integrated gender issues into its national plan to achieve the status of future economy by 2035 and had a national strategy for gender equality from the 2005 to 2015 period. In Cambodia, growth strategies promote contribution of women in the economy through gender integrated action groups in each ministry. Canada, Norway, Peru and Spain, among others, have sectorial gender integrating policies. For instance, since 1995, Canada has been conducting a gender-based analysis “GBA” to analyze the strength of all future legislation, policies and programmes and their impact on gender. Janine Berg, (2015).

In Egypt, the Ministry of Finance works with UN-Women on gender-responsive budgeting to identify specific budget lines that can focus on gender equality issues. In addition, tax exemption benefits,

which were previously only allowed for men, but now offered for women. Norway includes gender equality annexes in the fiscal budget. In Spain, gender impact analysis is involved by law. The Ministry of Finance and Economy of Peru practices gender-responsive budgeting has targeted gender inequality issues that change men and women socio-economic condition, as well as helps to control of poverty by providing opportunity to women. In Italy introduced gender integrated policies by programmes on food security, the environment, providing vocational training, job access in labour market.

UN-Women and the World Bank supported the Government of Côte d'Ivoire in 2013 and 2014 in drafting a national action plan on gender issues with the negotiation of government and civil society. In the Sudan, UN-Women also helped to integrate gender equality issues in national statistics office and in the national household survey questionnaire. (United Nations, 2015-16).

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) emphasizes the new Strategic Framework consisting five strategic objectives during the period of 2010 to 2019, targeted rural women issues and has identified policy and programmatic action focused on eradication of hunger, food insecurity and malnutrition. FAO take steps at national, regional, and global level at macroeconomic policy level, legal frameworks, coordination mechanisms and information systems for gender equality issue.

According to the Matthew Isabel Ortiz (2013) reported that policies provide equal opportunity of employment opportunities and skills development by providing vocational training to women. In Cambodia and Jordan, gender integrating national employment strategies, in Jordan and Singapore enacts laws prohibiting harassment and prohibiting discrimination in law, trade unions, and job discrimination.

In some countries, such as Egypt in order to enforce women's rights as guaranteed in national labor laws and the International Labor Organization (ILO) conventions, have set up equality units and audit and complaint systems within their ministries, to address discrimination and violence against women. Cuba has recently implemented a new labor code for the protection of the rights of women workers. Colombia has constructed action policies and mechanisms to control violence against women in the workplace.

Moreover, Colombia, the Dominican Republic and Italy have all approved the Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No. 189). In 2013 Jordan amended its labor law to conform to international labor standards regarding domestic work, reducing working hours to 8 hours a day and allow 14 days of annual leave and one day a week of rest (International Labor Organization, 2014).

McKinsey, (2014) identified the policies in his research that Governments recognize the importance women's work towards development by developed national strategies that promote entrepreneurship and increases in the number of women entrepreneurs and the increasing choice of employment opportunities.

Singapore provides credit facilities to encourage women entrepreneurship by vocational trainings and start up to generate income. Jordan has an offer financial service by micro-financing policy framework to open their own business.

### **Integrated policies of United Nations Agencies to Reduce and Redistribute Women's Unpaid Care Work**

Janine Berg (2015), examined in his research report regarding polices to reduce women's work load and redistribute the unpaid care work and support the reconciliation of household responsibilities. Most of countries reported having paid maternity leave systems in working place, and many also have paid paternity leave benefits. In Cambodia, provisions for female workers, including maternity leave and the obligation for enterprises employing over 100 workers to provide childcare facilitates are provided in labour law. Now initiatives have taken national gender equality strategies for providing access to day-care and community kindergarten facilities. Egypt also has labor laws with provisions for maternity leave, and Canada and Spain provide paid maternity leave benefits.

In order to reduce women's work load of unpaid work access to childcare facilities is the best policy from the government side. In the Dominican Republic, the Government provides subsidies for the creation of childcare centers. Recent efforts by the Government of Japan to increase childcare services and increasing of parental leave which help to reduce and redistribute the burden of childcare within the household and also to shift some part of the care responsibility to the public sector. Through these efforts female gets an opportunity to participate in other economic paid activities.

According to World Bank Report Member states have put in place a number of policies to ensure the provision of social security and social services, including parental leave, care services and social assistance programs.

### **Recognition of Women's Rights in Pakistan**

After the Beijing Forum in Pakistan the Women Development Departments (WDDs) were introduced in 1990s at the district level as an addition to Social Welfare Population Welfare, Sports, and Special Education etc. In Sindh, Balochistan, Punjab and KP, enforcing women's welfare projects & activities which are effective for increasing women's mobility in the labor market. In 2003 Independently Women Development Departments came into exist. In Punjab, a separate Women Development Directorate was established in 2006-7 to strengthen the Women Development Wing of Social Welfare under GRAP institutional reforms.

Aurat Foundation recognized as Agahi centers the AAWAZ programme operates in each union council of KP and Punjab. The centers are run by women focusing on women issues. Aurat Foundation is an important development platform has been the launch of Pakistan Civil Society Forum.

The Commission on the Status of Women (CSW) will address issues on women empowerment in the changing world of work'. In addition, it will assess progress in the implementation of the agreed conclusions from the fifty-eighth session (2014) on 'Challenges and achievements in the implementation of the Millennium Development Goals for women and girls'. The Commission will discuss as a focus area the 'Empowerment of indigenous women'.

At its sixtieth session, the Commission on the Status of Women highlighted issues for the gender-responsive implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in order to Achieving women's economic empowerment and the awareness of women's rights to work are essential for the full, effective and accelerated implementation of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action and the 2030 (Agenda for Sustainable Development). While the world of work is changing, due to gender discrimination and structural barriers to gender equality continue within and across countries.

**CONCLUSION**

This paper reviews some of the policies implemented in western and south Asian countries. It is concluded that different policy makers claimed that gender discrimination is invisible work has a long term negative effect on our economic development of a country, because due to the gender gap in the division of labor, which may reduce women's participation in the labor market and deprived from employment opportunities and economic resources. The state can play an important role in the implementing fair legislation, policies to support a more equal distribution of responsibilities between men and women.

The state can also have a positive impact on reducing the workload of women's unpaid work by providing and maintaining infrastructure such as access to clean water and gas facility. Effective public services such as childcare facilities, universal social security or easy access to water can help to redistribute unpaid care work from the individual to the state, which may provide an opportunity of choices. In terms of public policies, another point of action identified is supportive taxation.

**RECOMMENDATION**

- 1- The Government should have implemented parallel policies to the women working as unpaid worker and their work should be properly recognized and should enhance their contribution in the informal economy to ensure the provision of social security benefits to them. A cover of minimum wage legislation should be equally provided to all workers.
- 2- Working labor should be given skill training, more work, timely wages, housing facilities and access to loans and credits.
- 3- The Government should ratify International Labor Organization Convention on women Worker and should develop a national policy to recognize the unpaid work of women and should adopt appropriate legislation and provide safety nets for them.
- 4- If the unpaid contributions of women and men were properly recognized through social and economic policy by implicating regulations and institutions that must bring structural change in our society.

- 5- The Government of Pakistan is recommended to formulate a proper strategy by applying method and application which have applied in European countries to estimate unpaid work with the objective of integrating women's domestic work into calculations of Gross Domestic Production. In order to attain this objective, the policy makers should introduce organized policies and plans to encourage the socio-economic position of women in society.
- 6- It is suggested that the government must provide basic facilities at village level that would be helpful in reducing the burden of women, such as providing drinking water facility at door step and schools facility near to villages which help in reducing both time and workload of the rural women.
- 7- Seminars and workshops, debates, discussion programs should be organized on the integrating women's unpaid work by academic NGOs and government officials and academic level in this way that issue could be in cooperating into the government policies and national plan.
- 8- Research and academic institutions are recommended to introduce subject and research on serious issues such as impact of women's household and care work on economic growth, and also realized the long term impacts of the negligence of this problem which may negatively effect on economic growth of the country.

#### **REFERENCES**

- Alison Aggarwal (2013), Australian Human Rights Commission Report, World Employment Social Outlook: Trend 2013 (Geneva, 2013).
- Budlender, Debbie (2010), Time Use Studies and Unpaid Care Work, UNRISD" <http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BCCF9/search/414BA4D59E6D9AB1C125775B00480FD7?OpenDocument>
- Center for Gender and Social Transformation (2013), BRAC Development Institute (BDI) Unpaid Care Work: Situating it in Research and Policy Context in Bangladesh.
- Elson, Diane (2008), The Three R's of Unpaid Work: Recognition, Reduction and Redistribution, Presented at the Expert Group Meeting on Unpaid Work, Economic Development and Human Well-Being, United Nations Development Program.
- International Labor Organization (2014), World of Work Report: Developing with Jobs.

- Janine Berg (2015), *Labor Markets, Institutions and Inequality: Building Just Societies in the 21st Century*, International Labor Office/Edward Elgar.
- McKinsey (2014), *Women in Leadership From the First to the Norm*: [www.mckinsey.com/features/women\\_matter](http://www.mckinsey.com/features/women_matter).
- Matthew and Isabel Ortiz (2013), *The Age of Austerity: A Review of Public Expenditures and Adjustment Measures in 181 Countries*, Initiative for Policy Dialogue and the South Centre working paper.
- Swiedel, Joke (1999), *Unpaid work and policy making: Towards a broader perspective of work and employment* <http://www.un.org/esa/desa/papers/1999/esa99dp4.pdf>
- United Nations (2015-2016), *Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women, Progress of the World's Women Transforming Economies, Realizing Rights* (New York, 2015).
- UNRISD (2012), *Gender Patterns and Value of Unpaid Work: Findings from China's First Large-Scale Time Use Survey*.
- World Bank (2015), *World Development Indicators* <http://data.worldbank.org/data-catalog/world-development-indicators>".
-